

# Fail Criteria for Core Clerkships

## Overview of Clerkship Grades

The final grades in core clinical clerkships are determined by the Clerkship Director and/or a Clerkship Grading committee. Clerkship final grades are comprised of multiple grading components including clinical performance, NBME Subject Exam score, OSCE score (if applicable), professionalism, attendance and other assignments. Grades from clerkships include Honors, High Pass, Pass and Fail. There are no marginal grades in Phase 2.

Students may be at risk for a failing final grade based on the cumulative grade components as noted in detail below. The cumulative grade is comprised of weighted components defined by each clerkship in their syllabus. Thus, it is possible to be at risk for a fail without having a markedly poor performance in any one individual component of the grade.

Students can also fail a clerkship based on discrete criteria for professionalism, attendance or NBME performance as noted below. These elements are critical components for future physician performance, thus a student will fail the clerkship if these criteria are met regardless of a cumulative passing grade.

## Final Cumulative Clerkship Grade

Any student with a final cumulative clerkship grade at or below the scores listed is at risk for failing the clerkship. The criteria listed below are based on historical student performance data for each clerkship and meet the minimum competency threshold for training determined by each clerkship.

For any student with an at-risk final grade, the clerkship director and/or grading committee will review performance evaluations and exam scores and determine the final grade.

Please note that each clerkship has individualized weighting of grade components and different scoring systems. For full details see Canvas, clerkship syllabi, and orientation materials.

Clerkship	Cumulative Grade Passing Threshold	Cumulative Grade Full Points
Internal Medicine	174	200
Obstetrics and Gynecology	42.8	100
Psychiatry	50	100
Surgery	65	100
Pediatrics	64	100
Family Medicine	149	199

Note: The NBME exam and OSCE (if applicable) can comprise a significant portion of the cumulative grade for clerkships. Retakes of the NBME exam and OSCE are only allowed if the student fails the exam

on the first attempt. See the NBME Fail criteria below for full details on when retaking the NBME exam is allowed.

The following clerkships have OSCE exams as part of the cumulative grade. Fail criteria for the OSCE are listed below.

Clerkship	OSCE Fail Criteria	Retake
Internal Medicine	Failure of a high impact case OR cumulative score below 80 AND > 2.5 standard deviations below the class mean	Retake allowed if fail criteria met on first attempt
Surgery	No established fail criteria	No retake allowed
Pediatrics	No established fail criteria	No retake allowed

## Professionalism Fail Criteria

Professional behavior is an essential element of a successful physician. Any unprofessional behavior by students will be reviewed and discussed with clerkship leadership and a Professionalism Evaluation Form will be completed and forwarded to the Office of Student Affairs.

### Fail

- Greater than or equal to 3 episodes of non-egregious unprofessional behavior
- One episode of egregious unprofessional behavior

## Domains of Unprofessional Behavior

Assessments of professional behavior can be made in the following domains. While this list is not comprehensive, it does emphasize the areas of professionalism that are most commonly the cause of concern or deficiency. Unprofessional behavior by students in the domains noted with an asterisk (\*) have a statistically significant association with state medical board discipline in the future as a practicing physician.

- 1) Poor reliability and responsibility<sup>1\*,3\*,4</sup> or poor commitment<sup>2</sup>
  - a. Late or absent<sup>5</sup>
  - b. Missed deadlines<sup>5</sup>
  - c. Unreliable<sup>5</sup>
- 2) Poor initiative and motivation<sup>1\*,3\*</sup>
- 3) Immaturity<sup>1,3</sup>
- 4) Poor relationships with students, faculty, staff<sup>1,3\*,4</sup> OR poor working relationships<sup>2</sup>
  - a. Falsifying data<sup>5</sup>
  - b. Impaired communication with team<sup>5</sup>
- 5) Poor relationships with patients or patient families<sup>1,3,4</sup>
- 6) Lack of self-improvement and adaptability<sup>1\*,3\*,4</sup> OR lack of response to instruction<sup>2</sup>
  - a. Arrogant<sup>5</sup>
  - b. Hostile<sup>5</sup>
  - c. Defensive<sup>5</sup>

## Citations

- 1) Teherani A, Hodgson CS, Banach M, Papadakis MA. "Domains of unprofessional behavior during medical school associated with future disciplinary action by a state medical board." *Acad Med.* 2005 Oct;80(10 Suppl):S17-20.
- 2) PA Hemmer, R Hawkins, J L Jackson, L N Pangaro. "Assessing how well three evaluation methods detect deficiencies in medical students' professionalism in two settings of an internal medicine clerkship." *Acad Med.* 2000 Feb;75(2): 167-73.
- 3) Papadakis MA, Teherani A, Banach MA, Knettler TR, Rattner SL, Stern DT, Veloski JJ, Hodgson CS. "Disciplinary action by medical boards and prior behavior in medical school." *N Engl J Med.* 2005 Dec 22;353(25):2673-82.
- 4) Papadakis MA, Osborn EH, Cooke M, Healy K. "A strategy for the detection and evaluation of unprofessional behavior in medical students. University of California, San Francisco School of Medicine Clinical Clerkships Operation Committee." *Acad Med.* 1999 Sep;74(9):980-90.
- 5) Ziring D, Danoff D, Grosseman S, Langer D, Esposito A, Jan MK, Rosenzweig S, Novack D. "How Do Medical Schools Identify and Remediate Professionalism Lapses in Medical Students? A Study of U.S. and Canadian Medical Schools." *Acad Med.* 2015 Jul;90(7):913-20.

## Assessment and Remediation

- Any student who is at risk of meeting the fail criteria for professionalism shall have a Professionalism Evaluation Form completed by the clerkship director. This evaluation will be discussed with the student in a face-to-face meeting and a professionalism action plan will be developed. This professional remediation plan will be forwarded to the Student Affairs office for review.
- Any student who demonstrates unprofessional behavior across clerkships will meet with the student Affairs Office and the Student Evaluation Committee.

## NBME Score Fail Criteria

Performance on standardized board examinations is required to demonstrate baseline medical knowledge in the core clerkships. Subject exams fail criteria will be based upon percentile ranking and will utilize the time-adjusted score for the student's cohort group. Fail criteria align with recommended passing performance standards determined by national experts in each field.

### Fail

- Less than or equal to 1<sup>st</sup> percentile (or the lowest reported percentile for the quartile on the NBME score report)

## Assessment and Remediation

- The percentile score is determined from the raw score by using the NBME score report. The NBME score report from the year prior to the start of Phase 2 will be used for all the phase.
- The percentile score will also be adjusted as the student progresses through Phase 2 by using the quartiles in the NBME score report. The table below describes which quartile is used per clerkship cohort to determine the percentile from raw score. The quartile will be determined

for all students by the clerkship cohort they are scheduled to take, no adjustment will be made for off cycle cohorts.

<b>Determining NBME Percentile Score by Quartile</b>	
NBME Quartile	Clerkship Cohort
1	Internal Medicine 1, Psychiatry/OBGYN 1-2, Pediatrics/Surgery/Family Medicine 1
2	Internal Medicine 2, Psychiatry/OBGYN 3-4, Pediatrics/Surgery/Family Medicine 2-3
3	Internal Medicine 3, Psychiatry/OBGYN 5-6, Pediatrics/Surgery/Family Medicine 4
4	Internal Medicine 4, Psychiatry/OBGYN 7-8, Pediatrics/Surgery/Family Medicine 5-6

- Student with a failing or borderline performance on the NBME test will be notified by the clerkship director.
- Students with a failing performance on the NBME exam may retake the exam one time. The retake of the NBME exam must be completed by May 31 after the completion of Phase 2. Students are encouraged to discuss timing of the NBME retake with the Clerkship Directors, Academic Advisors and/or Student Affairs.
- The high score of the two exams will be used to determine the final grade. The highest final grade a student can receive after a retake of the NBME exam is a pass.
- Retake of the NBME exam is only allowed for a failing performance. This policy is consistent with the retake policies of Step exams and board certification tests.
- Any students with a score approximately 10<sup>th</sup> percentile performance or lower will be referred to the Director of Academic Advising/Student Affairs.

## Attendance Fail Criteria

Attendance along with full participation in clerkship and clinical activities is expected of all students. Please reference the Attendance Policy for any questions related to the definition of excused or unexcused absences. <https://www.unmc.edu/com/education/com-student-policies/com-policies/attendance.html#Phase2>

### Fail

- 2 or more unexcused days

### Assessment and Remediation

- Significant tardiness or failure to participate in clerkship activities may be considered an unexcused absence by faculty or clerkship directors.
- Make-up of activities missed due to both excused and unexcused absences is at the discretion of the clerkship director. Missed clinical experiences can be made up over weekends, breaks or holidays. Coordination with other clerkships and rotations is expected to appropriately schedule make-up experience without impacting future clinical experiences.
- Students are expected to communicate proactively with clerkship administrators about absences whenever possible.
- If you have a chronic condition that may cause absences during clinical rotations, a proactive discussion with the ADA office or your personal physician is recommended.

- Documentation of multiple unexcused absences may be a part of your final clerkship narrative and will result in the completion of the Professionalism Evaluation Form. Multiple unexcused absences or a pattern of unexcused absences over several clerkships may result in a referral to the Student Evaluation Committee.

## Overall

- A failing performance for professionalism, NBME score or attendance criteria results in a final failing grade overall.
- Overall clerkship performance comprised of multiple graded components such as clinical performance, OSCE (if applicable) and NBME below the passing threshold will place the student at risk for a final failing grade.
- Students who receive a final grade of fail will be required to remediate the course.

Reviewed and Approved by the Phase 2 Committee on December 14, 2021

Review and Approved by the Curriculum Committee on January 25, 2022

Approved by the Curriculum Committee on March 22, 2022